## **EXHIBIT D**

From:

Ben Hulse

To:

Ben Gordon; Daniel Nigh; Jan M. Conlin; Genevieve Zimmerman; david@pritzkerlaw.com; Annesley Degaris;

Noah Lauricella

Cc:

Ashley Woodard; Jerry Blackwell; Mary Young

Subject:

RE: Plaintiff's Expert Reports

Date:

Tuesday, January 29, 2019 10:01:00 AM

Attachments:

2018.11.06 -1580 Order denying Pltfs Objs to Magistrate Order Striking Pltfs Expert Reports.pdf

image001.ipg image002.jpg image003.jpg image004.jpg

## Counsel,

In the attached order, the Court affirmed Judge Schultz's order striking the Bushnell report and David supplemental report. This was an MDL-wide order that was not limited to the Axline case (the order is captioned: "This Document Relates to All Cases"). You have now re-served identical reports in Trombley. Will you help us understand your rationale for doing so? Is it a concern about preserving the issue for appeal in Trombley, despite the order's applicability to Trombley?

Assuming you will not withdraw these reports, we plan to file a motion by the end of the week. But as part of the meet and confer would like to know plaintiffs' basis – that may help streamline the briefing on both sides. Thank you.

Regards, Ben

Benjamin W. Hulse Blackwell Burke P.A. 431 South Seventh Street, Suite 2500 Minneapolis, MN 55415 Direct (612) 343-3256 Fax (612) 343-3205

This message and any attachments may contain information that is privileged, confidential, and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. If you are not the intended recipient or are not authorized to receive for the recipient, you are hereby notified that dissemination, distribution or copying of this message and any attachments is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please immediately advise the sender by reply e-mail and delete the message and any attachments. Thank you.

From: Ashley Woodard <awoodard@levinlaw.com>

**Sent:** Friday, January 25, 2019 3:36 PM

To: Ben Hulse <BHulse@blackwellburke.com>; Jerry Blackwell <blackwell@blackwellburke.com>; Mary Young <myoung@blackwellburke.com>

Cc: Ben Gordon <br/> <br/> / Sgordon@levinlaw.com>; Daniel Nigh <br/> <br/> / dnigh@levinlaw.com>; Jan M. Conlin <JMC@ciresiconlin.com>; Genevieve Zimmerman <gzimmerman@meshbesher.com>; dayid@pritzkerlaw.com; Annesley Degaris <adegaris@degarislaw.com>; Noah Lauricella <nlauricella@goldenberglaw.com>

**Subject:** Plaintiff's Expert Reports

Sent on behalf of Co-Lead Counsel, Mike Ciresi, Genevieve Zimmerman, and Ben Gordon

Dear All:

The following expert reports are being served herewith in the matter styled Ada Trombley v. 3M Company, 0:16-cv-04159 (JNE/DTS)

Case-Specific Expert Report of William Jarvis, M.D.

Case-Specific Expert Report of Eric Brown, M.D.

Supplemental Expert Reports of Yadin David, Ed.E., P.E., C.C.E. and Nathan Bushnell, Ph.D. along with exhibits

Ben, Mary, and Jerry:

Please confirm receipt of these electronic copies, and let me know if you wish to receive hard copies as well. Based on earlier discussions, I believe that Mr. Hulse has indicated electronic copies will suffice, but if you need hard copies we are happy to provide those too. Thanks much.

I will be in touch very soon with some deposition dates for you to consider.

Kind regards,

Plaintiffs' Co-Lead Counsel

Ben W. Gordon, Jr.
Of Counsel
Levin-Papantonio, P.A.

O: 850.435.7000 C: 850.432.7274

## **Ashley Woodard**

Project Leader
Bair Hugger Department
Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, Mitchell,
Rafferty & Proctor, P.A.
316 S. Baylen Street, Suite 600
Pensacola, FL 32502-5996
850.435.7148 (office)
850.436.6148(fax)
awoodard@levinlaw.com









THE INFORMATION CONTAINED IN THIS TRANSMISSION IS PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION INTENDED ONLY FOR USE OF THE INDIVIDUAL OR ENTITY NAMED ABOVE. IF THE READER OF THIS MESSAGE IS NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED THAT ANY DISSEMINATION, DISTRIBUTION OR COPYING OF THIS COMMUNICATION IS STRICTLY PROHIBITED. IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS TRANSMISSION IN ERROR, DO NOT READ IT. PLEASE IMMEDIATELY REPLY TO THE SENDER THAT YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS COMMUNICATION IN

ERROR. THEN DELETE IT. THANK YOU.